

## Message Text

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 01 STATE 059185

21

ORIGIN IO-03

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /004 R

66011

DRAFTED BY IO/SCT:LCAVANAUGH

APPROVED BY IO/SCT:LCAVANAUGH

----- 082495

R 110122Z MAR 76

FM SECSTATE WASHDC

TO USMISSION IAEA VIENNA

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE STATE 059185

FOLLOWING REPEAT BOMBAY 552 ACTION SECSTATE INFO NEW DELHI  
3 MAR

QUOTE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE BOMBAY 0552

E.O. 11652: NA

TAGS: TECH ENRG IN

SUBJ: ALLEGED RADIOACTIVITY IN TARAPUR

REF: BOMBAY 505

1. THERE FOLLOWS RECONCILIATION WHICH J.C. SHAH PROMISED BETWEEN HIS STATEMENTS (REPORTED NEW DELHI 1777) AND DR SETHNA'S PRESENTATION (REPORTED BOMBAY'S 505). SHAH STATED EMPHATICALLY THAT THERE IS NO INCONSISTENCY BETWEEN PARA 2(B) AND 2(D) OF BOMBAY'S 505 ON THE ONE HAND, AND HIS STATEMENTS REPORTED IN DELHI'S 1777, AND SHAH SAYS THAT IAEC STANDS BEHIND HIS STATEMENTS AS DEMONSTRATIONS OF THE GOOD HEALTH AND SAFETY PERFORMANCE AT TARAPUR. SHAH SAYS THAT HE PROVIDED DATA IN TERMS OF EFFECT ON PEOPLE AS BEING MORE PERSUASIVE TO THE KIND OF AUDIENCE HE FELT THE SENATE HEARINGS WERE ADDRESSING. HE SAID  
LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 02 STATE 059185

THAT SETHNA'S DATA, ON OTHER HAND, SIMPLY GIVES DATA TAKEN FROM

SAMPLES OF SEAFOOD IN TERMS OF ABSOLUTE CONTENT OF PICO CURIES (PCI/KG) PER KILOGRAM OF IODINE ISOTOPE OF 131 AND ISOTOPE OF CESIUM 134 AND 137 AND OF COBALT 60. SETHNA WANTED DATA CAST IN THIS FORM BECAUSE HE FELT THAT QUERY FROM NRC SCIENTISTS REQUIRED THIS TYPE OF TECHNICAL PRESENTATION.

2. SETHNA'S STATEMENT REGARDING IMPROVEMENT, OR LACK OF IT, IN FUEL IS DIFFERENT IN EMPHASIS BUT NOT IN SUBSTANCE, SHAH MAINTAINS. SPECIFICALLY, SETHNA SAYS "FUEL PERFORMANCE CANNOT BE SAID TO HAVE IMPROVED SIGNIFICANTLY. THE INITIAL FUEL OBTAINED BEFORE STATION STARTUP HAS PERFORMED POORLY AND THE SUBSEQUENT RELOADS OBTAINED PRIOR TO 1973 HAVE NOT BEEN MUCH BETTER". IN DISCUSSING THIS POINT, SHAH EMPHASIZED THAT SETHNA'S POINT DOES NOT DENY THAT THERE HAS BEEN SOME IMPROVEMENT IN FUEL PERFORMANCE. SHAH SAYS THAT SUCCEEDING BUNDLES OF FUEL ELEMENT WERE BETTER, BUT AS THERE WAS SOME HYDRATION STILL IN THE CORE, THE AMOUNT OF LEAKAGE WAS NOT REDUCED ALL THAT MUCH, SO ONE CANNOT CITE STATISTICS DEMONSTRATING CONCLUSIVELY THAT FUEL PERFORMANCE IS REALLY ON A SUBSTANTIAL UPGRADE. ONE UNSTATED POINT IN BOTH OF THESE PRESENTATIONS, OF COURSE, IS THAT IAEC HAS COLLECTED ON ITS FUEL WARRANTY FROM GE BECAUSE FUEL DID NOT FULLY MEASURE UP TO EXPECTATIONS. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT SETHNA IS SIMPLY BEING EXTREMELY CAUTIOUS TO PRESERVE HIS LEGAL POSITION, VIS A VIS HIS SUPPLIER. ANY OF THE ABOVE STATEMENTS, EXCEPT THOSE REFERRING TO THE WARRANTY PROBLEM AND COLLECTION EFFORTS MADE BY THE INDIAN DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC ENERGY AGAINST GE, MAY BE USED IN WHATEVER STATEMENTS NRC WISHES TO MAKE TO THE SENATE COMMITTEE ON THIS MATTER. OBVIOUSLY THE U.S. GOVERNMENT CANNOT GET IN-BETWEEN GE AND THE IAEC IN THEIR DISPUTE OVER CONTRACT PERFORMANCE.

3. BOTH SHAH AND SETHNA REMAIN QUITE WILLING TO FURNISH WHATEVER FURTHER CLARIFICATION MAY BE REQUIRED ON THIS MATTER.  
COURTNEY  
UNQTE. INGERSOLL

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** RADIOACTIVE WASTES, NUCLEAR POWER PLANTS, NUCLEAR FUELS, NUCLEAR SAFETY  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 11 MAR 1976  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** GolinoFR  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1976STATE059185  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** LCAVANAUGH  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** N/A  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Film Number:** D760092-0313  
**From:** STATE  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1976/newtext/t19760370/aaaacjwd.tel  
**Line Count:** 96  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Office:** ORIGIN IO  
**Original Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 2  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** 76 BOMBAY 505  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** GolinoFR  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 29 MAR 2004  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <29 MAR 2004 by ShawDG>; APPROVED <30 MAR 2004 by GolinoFR>  
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
04 MAY 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** ALLEGED RADIOACTIVITY IN TARAPUR  
**TAGS:** TECH, ENRG, IN, (SHAH, J C), (SETHNA, HOMI N)  
**To:** IAEA VIENNA  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006